

MINUTES

CAPITOLA PLANNING COMMISSION THURSDAY, AUGUST 7, 2008 7:00 P.M. – COUNCIL CHAMBERS

Chairperson Harlan called the Regular Meeting of the Capitola Planning Commission to order at 7:06 P.M.

1. ROLL CALL AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Present: Commissioners Hale, Newman, Norton and Chairperson Harlan Absent: Commissioner Burke (excused) Staff: Interim Community Development Director Carney Senior Planner Bane Associate Planner Akeman Minute Clerk Uharriet

2. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

A. Additions and Deletions to Agenda

None

B. <u>Public Comments</u>

Paul Gultiere, spoke on behalf of his mother and father and their culture.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

July 3, 2008

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER NORTON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER NEWMAN TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE JULY 3, 2008 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING.

MOTION PASSED 3-0, COMMISSIONER HALE ABSTAINED.

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

A. <u>1806 47TH AVENUE</u> - PROJECT APPLICATION #08-038 ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE REVIEW FOR A REMODEL AND SINGLE-STORY ADDITION TO A SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE IN THE R-1 (SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE) ZONING DISTRICT. (APN 034-022-31) CATEGORICALLY EXEMPT. FILED 6/26/08 *1 PROPERTY OWNER/APPLICANT: ED ORTEGA

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER NORTON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER HALE TO APPROVE APPLICATION #08-038 WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS AND FINDINGS:

CONDITIONS

- 1. The project approval consists of the demolition of a single-family residence a construction of a new 1,593 square foot two-story residence with garage at 603 Oak Drive.
- 2. The Planning Commission must approve any significant modifications to the size or exterior appearance of the structure.
- 3. The final building plans shall include public improvement plans for curbs, gutters and sidewalks along 47th Avenue. The improvements shall be in place prior to final inspection, subject to approval of the Public Works Director.
- 4. Affordable housing in-lieu fees shall be paid as required to assure compliance with the City of Capitola Affordable (Inclusionary) Housing Ordinance. Any appropriate fees shall be paid prior to building permit issuance.
- 5. Prior to granting of final occupancy, compliance with all conditions of approval shall be demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director.
- 6. The landscape plan shall be submitted with the building permit application and shall include the specific number of plants of each type and their size, as well as the irrigation system to be utilized. The landscaping shall be installed prior to final building occupancy.
- 7. The utilities shall be underground to the nearest utility pole in accordance with PG&E and Public Works Department requirements. A note shall be placed on the final building plans indicating this requirement.
- 8. An encroachment permit shall be acquired for any work performed in the right-of-way.
- 9. Hours of construction shall be Monday to Friday 7:30AM 9:00PM, and Saturday 9:00AM 4:00PM, per city ordinance.

FINDINGS

A. The application, subject to the conditions imposed, will secure the purposes of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan, and Local Coastal Plan.

Planning Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms to the development standards of the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District, as well as the Guidelines for Single Family Residential Projects. Conditions of approval have been included to carry out the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan and Local Coastal Plan.

B. The application will maintain the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

Planning Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms to the development standards of the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District, as well as the Guidelines for Single Family Residential Projects. Conditions of approval have been included to ensure that the project maintains the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

C. This project is categorically exempt under Section 15301(e)(2) of the California Environmental Quality Act and is not subject to Section 753.5 of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations.

Section 15301(e)(2) of the CEQA Guidelines exempts additions to structures that are less than 10,000 square feet if the project is in an area where all public facilities are available to allow for the development and the project is not located in an environmentally sensitive area. This project involves an addition to a one-story single-family residence that is considered infill development. No adverse environmental impacts were discovered during review of the proposed project

APPROVED 4-0

B. 207 MONTEREY AVENUE - PROJECT APPLICATION #08-032

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF A COASTAL PERMIT AND MINOR LAND DIVISION TO CONVERT A COMMERCIAL RETAIL SPACE AND TWO APARTMENT UNITS IN TO THREE CONDOMINIUM UNITS IN THE CV (CENTRAL VILLAGE) ZONING DISTRICT. (APN 035-185-23) CATEGORICALLY EXEMPT. FILED 5/29/08 *1 PROPERTY OWNER/ APPLICANT: GI 112 CAPITOLA & 207 MONTEREY AVENUE, LLC

Commissioner Newman removed item B and C. He questioned staff if the adjacent properties were under the same ownership and if the condominium conversion ordinance applies to these applications. If the ordinance applies, then there should be a tentative map on the parcels prior to qualifying for the conversion. He requested a legal opinion from the City Attorney.

Commissioner Norton stated that both parcels were built out at the same time, but questioned if the property lines changed with the new buildings or are they the original property lines. He also questioned if the application creates a double split.

Commissioner Hale questioned if this proposal is an end run around the condominium conversion ordinance.

Chairperson Harlan requested that the City Attorney attend the September 4, 2008 meeting.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER NORTON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER NEWMAN TO CONTINUE APPLICATION #08-032 TO THE SEPTEMBER 4, 2008 MEETING.

MOTION PASSED 4-0

C. <u>112 CAPITOLA AVENUE - PROJECT APPLICATION #08-033</u>

REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF A COASTAL PERMIT AND A MINOR LAND DIVISION TO CONVERT A COMMERCIAL RETAIL SPACE AND AN APARTMENT UNIT IN TO TWO CONDOMINIUM UNITS IN THE CV (CENTRAL VILLAGE) ZONING DISTRICT. (APN 035-185-24) CATEGORICALLY EXEMPT. FILED 5/29/08 *1 PROPERTY OWNER/ APPLICANT: GI 112 CAPITOLA & 207 MONTEREY AVENUE, LLC

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER NORTON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER NEWMAN TO CONTINUE APPLICATION #08-033 TO THE SEPTEMBER 4, 2008 MEETING.

MOTION PASSED 4-0

5. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. <u>1710 41ST AVENUE</u>- PROJECT APPLICATION #08-022

ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE REVIEW FOR AN EXTERIOR REMODEL, SIGN PERMIT, AND MODIFICATION TO AN EXISTING RETAIL CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT TO PERMIT OUTDOOR SEATING AND PRODUCT DISPLAY FOR A

COMMERCIAL BUILDING (FORMERLY RALPH'S) IN THE CC (COMMUNITY COMMERCIAL) ZONING DISTRICT. (APN 034-131-07) CATEGORICALLY EXEMPT. FILED 4/29/08 PROPERTY OWNER: SANDELMAN SANFORD TRUSTEE C/O RALPHS FOODS APPLICANT: WHOLE FOODS MARKET/BECKHAM DESIGN GROUP ARCHITECTS

Senior Planner Bane presented the staff report.

Commissioner Hale ascertained that the proposed signs will be internally lit.

Commissioner Newman stated that the parking lot improvements will eliminate the "for sale" parking lot problem. He suggested the addition of a condition to prohibit overnight parking and parking vehicles "for sale".

Glen Moon, representative from Whole Foods, spoke in support of the project. He commended that all of the proposed signs will be internally lit with LED lights.

Commissioner Norton questioned how the applicant will be dealing with food packaging and encouraged the applicant to prohibit Styrofoam even though the Ordinance does not regulate grocery stores, but it does regulate the restaurant portion. He ascertained that the applicant did not consider photovoltaic in the building remodel design. He proposed a redesign of the parking area along the south side of the property. He suggested eliminating three parking spaces to increase the exterior public seating area at the corner of the building. The three parking spaces could be placed along the landscape area along 41st Avenue. He stated that the trade off for relocated parking is additional public area. Additionally the parking proposed along the storefront could wrap around to the corner of the building and out of the flow of traffic.

Commissioner Hale asked the applicant to specify which signs they would prefer on the building and/or frontage. The applicant responded that the sign at the front door is preferred over the sign at the side of the store.

Commissioner Newman ascertained that the signage proposed included monument signs and wall signs.

The public hearing was opened.

Ron Graves, resident, discussed non-conforming signs and commented that the second proposed monument sign will need an amendment to the sign ordinance. He also stated that the cars for sale in the parking lot are an ongoing problem.

Paul Gultiere, spoke in support of the application.

Patricia Matechec, property owner on 42nd Avenue, directly behind the Whole Foods property, spoke in support of the application, but had concerns about the existing wall along the property line. She suggested the installation of an eight foot split face block wall, similar to the wall at the rear of Brown Bulb Ranch. She requested consideration of tree replacement at the rear of the site. She also spoke with concerns about how carts will stay on the property.

Chris Bush, spoke in support of the application.

The public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Newman stated that the Commission had received a letter from member of public regarding the recycling bins. He supported the wall sign on the 41st Avenue frontage, noting that the sign area should not exceed the maximum allowable area. He suggested a condition that places the responsibility on the property tenant, Whole Foods, to remove and enforce removal of cars placed on the site for the purpose of sale.

Commissioner Hale ascertained that the bike parking is located at the front of the building, although the parking is not clearly delineated on the plans and there is no mention of bicycle parking in the conditions of approval. She supported the installation of a wall and landscaping at the rear property. She supported one sign per frontage and that the poles for the sign along Capitola Road should be removed.

Commissioner Norton supported maximum 8' high split face block wall with graffiti proof finish, with the option to reduce the height based on the consideration of the neighboring parcels; and the addition of nine trees at the rear of the property and drought tolerant groundcover on the rear property.

Chairperson Harlan requested the applicant discuss how the carts will stay on the property. She supported one sign per frontage and that the poles for the sign along Capitola Road should be removed.

Glen Moon, representative from Whole Foods, responded to the Commissions questions. The shopping carts have an electronic device to lock the wheels of the carts if they get too far from the door. The carts will be stored outside of the store. He was supportive of all the modifications suggested by the Commission.

Senior Planner Bane stated that the recycling issue raised by Craig French, Redtree Properties, may be a 41st Avenue Corridor issue to be addressed under state law and in consultation with the City Attorney's office. The recycling issue may be brought before the City Council for discussion.

Commissioner Norton made a motion to approve the application with the following additional conditions:

- 1. The applicant redesign the SW corner public area/parking area by removing three parking spaces and creating a larger public area. The three parking spaces shall be sited elsewhere on the property.
- 2. The applicant design and install an 8' split face block wall, with graffiti coating along the rear property line.
- 3. The applicant shall install drought tolerant ground cover and trees, as recommended by staff, along the rear property line.
- 4. The applicant shall be prohibited from using Styrofoam packaging.
- 5. The tenant, Whole Foods, shall be the responsible party for removal and enforcement of cars for sale in the parking lot area.
- 6. The application includes the approval of one wall sign at the entry of the store, a monument sign at 41st Avenue and a monument sign at Capitola Road.

Commissioner Newman stated that he was uncomfortable with a condition to removing parking and creating public space. He would rather give the applicant the option of redesigning to the Commission's suggestions.

Commissioner Norton thanked Whole Foods for the application and stated that he was looking forward to their new business in Capitola. All commissioners concurred.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER NORTON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER HALE TO APPROVE APPLICATION #08-022 WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS AND FINDINGS:

CONDITIONS

- The project approval consists an extensive interior and exterior remodel of an existing commercial building (formerly Ralph's), to make way for a new Whole Foods Market to occupy the former retail supermarket space. No new square footage is proposed, but improvements include an exterior facelift of the west (front) and south elevations of the store, in addition to new signage and landscaping.
- 2. Any significant modifications to the size or exterior appearance of the approved design must be approved by the Planning Commission. Similarly, any significant change to the use itself, or the site, must be approved by the Planning Commission.
- 3. The application shall be reviewed by the Planning Commission upon evidence of noncompliance with conditions of approval or applicable municipal code provisions.
- 4. Business hours shall be limited to 8AM 10PM.
- 5. Delivery hours shall be limited to 8AM 8PM to minimize noise impacts to neighboring residents. Delivery vehicles shall not be permitted to remain at idle during non-delivery hours.
- 6. Air-conditioning equipment and other roof top equipment shall be screened from view and fall within the allowable city permitted decibel levels.
- 7. Trash enclosures shall be covered, gated and maintained to provide a clean and sanitary area.
- 8. Security lighting in the rear of the store shall be shielded to prevent light from shining on to neighboring properties.
- 9. No roof equipment is to be visible to the general public. Any necessary roof screening is to match the color of the building as closely as possible. Plans for any necessary screening shall be submitted to the Community Development Department prior to, or in conjunction with, building permit submittal.
- 10. Prior to issuance of a building permit, any necessary encroachment permit shall be obtained from the Public Works Director.
- 11. The applicant shall comply with all requirements of the Santa Cruz Water District with regard to the required landscape irrigation and any other new water fixture requirements.
- 12. The final landscape plan submitted with the building permit application shall include the specific number of plants of each type and their size, as well as the irrigation system to be utilized. A drip irrigation system shall be incorporated as part of the landscape plan.
- 13. The project shall meet the 41st Avenue Design Guideline which recommends one 24" box tree be planted for every two car spaces. The total number on site shall be no less than 51 trees.
- 14. The applicant shall develop, submit, and enact a plan for the use and control of their carts, including a plan to collect carts removed from their property.

- <u>15. The applicant redesign the SW corner public area/parking area by removing three parking spaces and creating a larger public area. The three parking spaces shall be sited elsewhere on the property.</u>
- <u>16. The applicant design and install an 8' split face block wall, with graffiti coating along the rear</u> property line.
- 17. The applicant shall install drought tolerant ground cover and trees, as recommended by staff, along the rear property line.
- 18. The applicant shall be prohibited from using Styrofoam packaging.
- <u>19. The tenant, Whole Foods, shall be the responsible party for removal and enforcement of cars</u> for sale in the parking lot area.
- 20. The application includes the approval of one wall sign at the entry of the store, a monument sign at 41st Avenue and a monument sign at Capitola Road.

FINDINGS

A. The application, subject to the conditions imposed, will secure the purposes of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan, and Local Coastal Plan.

Community Development Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms with the development standards of the CC (Community Commercial) Zoning District and the 41st Avenue Design Guidelines. Conditions of approval have been included to carry out the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance and General Plan.

B. The application will maintain the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

Planning Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms with the development standards of the CC (Community Commercial) Zoning District and the 41st Avenue Design Guidelines. Conditions of approval have been included to ensure that the project maintains the character and integrity of the area.

C. This project is categorically exempt under Section 15301(e)(2) of the California Environmental Quality Act and is not subject to Section 753.5 of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations.

Section 15301(e)(2) of the CEQA Guidelines exempts interior or exterior alterations to existing structures. No adverse environmental impacts were discovered during review of the proposed project.

APPROVED 4-0

B. <u>410 ESCALONA- PROJECT APPLICATION #08-034</u>

COASTAL PERMIT AND ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE REVIEW TO DEMOLISH A SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE AND DETACHED GARAGE AND CONSTRUCT A NEW TWO-STORY SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE AND DETACHED SECONDARY DWELLING UNIT IN THE R-1 (SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE) ZONING DISTRICT. (APN 036-121-24) FILED 5/30/08 *1 PROPERTY OWNERS: T.J. & CONNIE WELCH

APPLICANT: DEREK VAN ALSTINE

Associate Planner Akeman presented the staff report.

Commissioner Hale ascertained that the setback for the accessory dwelling unit will be 5' not 7' as shown on the plans.

Derek van Alstine, designer, spoke in support of the application. The height of the chimney is prescribed by building code standards. He did not think the chimney will not see from the front elevation.

The public hearing was opened and closed.

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER NEWMAN AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER HALE TO APPROVE APPLICATION #08-034 WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS AND FINDINGS:

CONDITIONS

- 1. The project approval consists of the demolition of a single-family residence and construction of a new 3,423 square foot two-story single-family residence with garage, including a 400 square foot secondary unit at 410 Escalona Drive.
- 2. The Planning Commission must approve any significant modifications to the size or exterior appearance of the structure.
- 3. Prior to granting of final occupancy, compliance with all conditions of approval shall be demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Zoning Administrator or Community Development Director.
- 4. The property owner shall file a deed restriction with the County Recorder prior to building permit issuance. The deed restriction shall include the following restrictions:
 - The secondary dwelling unit shall not be sold separately.
 - The unit is restricted to the approved size.

• The administrative review or the architectural and site review permit, whichever applies, for the secondary dwelling unit shall be in effect only so long as the owner of record occupies either the main residence or the secondary dwelling unit.

• The above declarations are binding upon any successor in ownership of the property. Lack of compliance shall be cause for code enforcement and/or revoking the administrative review or the architecture and site review permit, whichever applies.

- The deed restrictions shall lapse upon removal of the secondary dwelling unit
- 5. Hours of construction shall be Monday to Friday 7:30AM 9:00PM, and Saturday 9:00AM 4:00PM, per city ordinance.
- 6. The landscape plan shall be submitted with the building permit application and shall include the specific number of plants of each type and their size, as well as the irrigation system to be utilized. The landscaping shall be installed prior to final building occupancy.
- 7. The utilities shall be underground to the nearest utility pole in accordance with PG&E and Public Works Department requirements. A note shall be placed on the final building plans indicating this requirement.
- 8. An encroachment permit shall be acquired for any work performed in the right-of-way.

9. Affordable housing in-lieu fees shall be paid as required to assure compliance with the City of Capitola Affordable (Inclusionary) Housing Ordinance. Any appropriate fees shall be paid prior to building permit issuance.

FINDINGS

A. The application, subject to the conditions imposed, will secure the purposes of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan, and Local Coastal Plan.

Community Development Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms to the development standards of the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District, as well as the Guidelines for Single Family Residential Projects. Conditions of approval have been included to carry out the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan and Local Coastal Plan.

B. The application will maintain the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

Community Development Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms to the development standards of the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District, as well as the Guidelines for Single Family Residential Projects. Conditions of approval have been included to ensure that the project maintains the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

C. This project is categorically exempt under Section 15303(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act and is not subject to Section 753.5 of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations.

This project involves construction of a new single-family residence in the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District. Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines exempts the construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone.

APPROVED 4-0

C. 603 OAK DRIVE - PROJECT APPLICATION #08-036

COASTAL PERMIT AND ARCHITECTURAL AND SITE REVIEW TO DEMOLISH A ONE-STORY SINGLE-FAMILY HOUSE AND CONSTRUCT A NEW TWO-STORY SINGLE-FAMILY HOUSE WITH ATTACHED GARAGE IN THE R-1 (SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE) ZONING DISTRICT. (APN 035-073-08) FILED 6/12/08 *1 PROPERTY OWNERS: FORSTER/GAUKEL APPLICANT: DEREK VAN ALSTINE

Associate Planner Akeman presented the staff report.

Derek van Alstine, spoke in support of the application.

The public hearing was opened and closed.

Commissioner Norton stated that he supported the application, but that as small homes are replaced with larger homes a touch of Capitola disappears,

Commissioner Newman agreed with Commissioner Norton and stated that the issue of home sizes should be reviewed with General Plan update.

PAGE 10

A MOTION WAS MADE BY COMMISSIONER HALE AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER HARLAN TO APPROVE APPLICATION #08-036 WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS AND FINDINGS:

CONDITIONS

- 1. The project approval consists of the demolition of a single-family residence a construction of a new 1,593 square foot two-story residence with garage at 603 Oak Drive.
- 2. The Planning Commission must approve any significant modifications to the size or exterior appearance of the structure.
- 3. Curb and gutter that is currently deteriorated or is damaged during construction shall be repaired or replaced, as determined by and to the satisfaction of the Public Works Director.
- 4. Affordable housing in-lieu fees shall be paid as required to assure compliance with the City of Capitola Affordable (Inclusionary) Housing Ordinance. Any appropriate fees shall be paid prior to building permit issuance.
- 5. Prior to granting of final occupancy, compliance with all conditions of approval shall be demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Community Development Director.
- 6. The landscape plan shall be submitted with the building permit application and shall include the specific number of plants of each type and their size, as well as the irrigation system to be utilized. The landscaping shall be installed prior to final building occupancy.
- 7. The utilities shall be underground to the nearest utility pole in accordance with PG&E and Public Works Department requirements. A note shall be placed on the final building plans indicating this requirement.
- 8. An encroachment permit shall be acquired for any work performed in the right-of-way.
- 9. Hours of construction shall be Monday to Friday 7:30AM 9:00PM, and Saturday 9:00AM 4:00PM, per city ordinance.

FINDINGS

A. The application, subject to the conditions imposed, will secure the purposes of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan, and Local Coastal Plan.

Planning Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms to the development standards of the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District, as well as the Guidelines for Single Family Residential Projects. Conditions of approval have been included to carry out the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance, General Plan and Local Coastal Plan.

B. The application will maintain the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

Planning Department Staff, the Architectural and Site Review Committee, and the Planning Commission have all reviewed the project. The project conforms to the development standards of the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District, as well as the Guidelines for Single Family Residential Projects. Conditions of approval have been included to ensure that the project maintains the character and integrity of the neighborhood.

C. This project is categorically exempt under Section 15303(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act and is not subject to Section 753.5 of Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations.

This project involves construction of a new single-family residence in the R-1 (Single Family Residence) Zoning District. Section 15303 of the CEQA Guidelines exempts the construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone.

APPROVED 4-0

6. NEW BUSINESS

NONE

7. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Director's Report

Acting Community Development Director Carnery gave an update on the Community Development Director's recruitment process. He also provided an update on the status of the Rispin Project.

Commission Comments

Commissioner Norton questioned if Target was considering the Mervyn's space. Chairperson Harlan questioned the status of Mervyn's. She also questioned what type of work is approved or going on at the property behind Orchard Supply. She announced that City Hall is building a float for the Begonia Festival. Commissioner Hale announced the upcoming movies on the beach.

8. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourned at 9:20 P.M. to a Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission to be held on Thursday, September 4, 2008, in the City Hall Council Chambers, 420 Capitola Avenue, Capitola, California.

Adopted by the Planning Commission on September 4, 2008

Approved by Ryan Bane, Senior Planner _____